

Can Unit Failure Be Prevented Through Trained Successors?

*Benjamin Hardy
District Commissioner
Pellissippi District
Great Smoky Mountain Council
Boy Scouts of America*

June 2016

Piedmont-Appalachian College of Commissioner Science

Ridgecrest Conference Center

Ridgecrest, NC

Walter Lynn Bates, Adviser

To the Doctoral Candidate Review Board:

I am submitting herewith a Dissertation written by Benjamin Hardy, entitled "Can Unit Failure Be Prevented Through Trained Successors?". I have examined the final copy of this report for format and content and recommend that it be accepted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Commissioner Science.

Walter L. Bates

Walter Lynn Bates

We have read this Dissertation
and recommend its acceptance:

[Signature]
Coastal Carolina Council

[Signature]
Daniel Boone Council

Walter L. Bates
Great Smoky Mountain Council

Indian Waters Council

[Signature]
Palmetto Council

[Signature]
Piedmont Council

[Signature]
Sequoyah Council

Accepted for the Piedmont-Appalachian College of
Commissioner Science:

Jan H. Blake

Chairman
Doctoral Candidate Review Board
and Blue Ridge Council

Acknowledgements

This paper has been put off for over a year, due to the birth of my son, Branigan. As he continues to grow, I hope to take him camping, backpacking and whitewater rafting, just like my family did with me when I was growing up. My work as a Commissioner has been to further the Scouting program. And hopefully, in the coming years, Branigan will get to experience and enjoy not the same Scouting program, but a better one than what has existed in the past. I would like to dedicate this paper and my work in Scouting to him.

I would like to thank the endless list of Scoutmasters, Commissioners and other leaders in both the Great Smoky Mountain Council and the (now merged) Birmingham Area Council, as well as the Pellissippi Lodge in the Order of the Arrow. Many of these individuals were my adult leaders or Order of the Arrow advisers in my youth, but now serve alongside me in my current roles. I also want to thank the youth who I serve for: Christopher Beach, Jacob McCrary, Spencer Siefke, and Justin & Shane Carroll, all young Eagle Scouts who have taught me more than I probably have taught them. While Wood Badge offered a great opportunity to learn how to be an effective leader, the youth of all the programs have given me insight that you can only achieve when you're around them. I also want to thank all the members of the Piedmont-Appalachian College of Commissioner Science Doctoral Review Board and staff. Their guidance and advice has made this thesis the effective tool it was designed to be.

Lastly, I would like to thank the following individuals for their help and guidance over the past few years:

Timothy Carroll, Assistant Council Commissioner, Great Smoky Mountain Council

James McCrary, Scoutmaster - Troop 131, Great Smoky Mountain Council

Walter Lynn Bates, Assistant Council Commissioner, Great Smoky Mountain Council

Keith Gaines, Wood Badge Course Director, Great Smoky Mountain Council

Dennis Curtain, Scoutmaster - Troop 73, Great Smoky Mountain Council

Shannon Siefke, Crew Adviser - Crew 8, Great Smoky Mountain Council

R. Scott Thomas, Cubmaster - Pack 506, Great Smoky Mountain Council

Neal Drown, Pellissippi District Executive - Great Smoky Mountain Council

Jessica Bivens, Unit Commissioner / Renaissance Woman - Great Smoky Mountain Council

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER	PAGE
1. INTRODUCTION	1
2. METHODS	4
3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	6
4. CONCLUSION	17
APPENDICES	
Appendix A. Questionnaire – Blank Form	19
Appendix B. Questionnaire – Troop 1	22
Appendix C. Questionnaire – Troop 2	25
Appendix D. Questionnaire – Troop 3	28
Appendix E. Questionnaire – Pack 1	31
Appendix F. Questionnaire – Troop 4	35
Appendix G. Questionnaire – Pack 2	38
Appendix H. Questionnaire – Pack 3	41
Appendix I. Questionnaire – Troop 5	44
Appendix J. Questionnaire – Troop 6	47
Appendix K. Questionnaire – Pack 4	50
Appendix L. Questionnaire – Troop 7	53

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this thesis is to survey and analyze why units fall apart without foresight from the chartered organization or Scouting district. This problem affects not only newer units with untrained leaders, but also well established units that had been around for decades. By figuring out exactly why units might fold unexpectedly, there may be steps Commissioners can take to prevent this from occurring before it's too late.

To gain a better understanding of where units were with their adult leadership, I conducted a district-wide survey asking their unit leaders 18 questions. You'll find the complete questionnaire on page 19, but the intention was to find out 1) how active these units are, 2) how prepared their assistants are to succeeding as unit leader and 3) what steps should be taken to ensure the unprepared units don't fail.

For several reasons, I've changed the unit numbers and have kept the unit leaders anonymous. The purpose of the surveys was to analyze a group of various Scouting units without the politics of those units polluting the results. Some unit leaders are forced out and my intention was not to embarrass anyone, but I still wanted to keep the reasons for their leaving honest. I am registered in two districts in the Great Smoky Mountain Council and these surveys were sent to units in both. All the units were made aware of how these results would be used and were provided with this material.

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

In 1997, two major events happened to me that affected the life I have today. The first was I completed my Eagle Scout requirements and the second was my family moved back from Birmingham, AL to my mother's hometown of Sunbright, TN. In this small town, there were no Scouting programs of any kind. Having attended Scout meetings since I was a toddler, it didn't take but a few months for me to really miss it. Both my parents had served as a Scoutmaster and a Cubmaster and both of my much older brothers had been in Scouting. However, only one of them earned Eagle. Growing up, I didn't differentiate between my brothers' troop meetings and my own Cub Scout meetings. As a Tiger Cub, I learned to tie knots, camp, raft, climb and wondered what happened during one's Vigil Honor ceremony with the Order of the Arrow.

In Sunbright, I took it upon myself to establish a new troop through the local Methodist church. I got lucky by discovering one of our football coaches also happened to be an Eagle Scout and he agreed to serve as our first Scoutmaster. Upon chartering, we had upwards of over 20 boys who were eager (and who had equally eager parents) to discover Scouting for the first time. Our first year was great, but rough, too. I taught them how to backpack, tie knots, and how to make a color guard look better than any ROTC color guard. But one of our issues came with sibling/cousin rivalries. Separating siblings and cousins in different patrols didn't necessarily ease that, but we had several other things going for us. One, we were camping once a month, while earning the first ranks. Two, we had uniforms and equipment. And three, we had great support from our district; despite being an hour's drive from their Roundtable meetings.

I served as the Senior Patrol Leader until I was almost 18 and still remained very active as an Assistant Scoutmaster. Looking back, I would say I was more of a Senior Patrol Leader “advisor” when I turned 18. I also remained active in the local Order of the Arrow lodge, serving as a lodge officer and chairman of various committees. Eventually I left Sunbright for a college outside of Nashville which was three hours away. After I left, the troop I had started and had grown to love began letting petty differences ruin the Scouting experience which led to half the troop leaving and starting their own troop. Within two years, both troops ended up failing and folding into nothing but a memory.

Almost a decade later in 2011, Tim Carroll introduced me to the commissioner program; he was a Unit Commissioner at the time and the father of the Chapter Chief I was advising in the OA. As Tim explained what exactly a Unit Commissioner did, I began to wonder where my troop’s Commissioner was during that time years earlier. Before accepting Tim’s request to serve as one of his Unit Commissioners, I researched exactly what I would be expected to do. One of the qualities Commissioners were supposed to possess was a career-worth of Scouting experience. It wasn’t a position for new parents to the program, unlike a Den Leader or an Assistant Scoutmaster role.

Even though I was still under 30 years old, I felt like the experience in my youth with my failed troop and also as an officer at the lodge level in the Order of the Arrow made for a useful Unit Commissioner. In a family of Scouters, I felt like the Eli Manning of my council. If you aren’t a sports fan, Eli is the youngest of the Manning family, whose father Archie and big brother Peyton are both successful NFL quarterbacks. And like my family, there is that one

Manning brother who never made it to the pros; just like my brother who never finished his Eagle Scout requirements. With that in mind, I decided to accept Tim's offer and further my training through Wood Badge and Commissioners College.

I signed up to be a Unit Commissioner to prevent an episode like that one from ever happening to a troop in my district again. I am certain that had a Commissioner been in place and used effectively, the troop would have had a better chance of succeeding where it had failed. To make up for what I wasn't able to do years earlier, I became determined to learn all I could, so I could help a unit from failing because no one was there to prevent it.

CHAPTER 2

METHODS

My first order of business in discovering the current status of where units were, in regards to unit leadership, was to write and distribute a questionnaire asking the right kind of questions. I needed to know how trained the current unit leader was, how long they'd been on the job, and do they have an assistant in mind to succeed them? I also wanted to know what the turnover was for unit leaders. Are they serving for three to four years or are they just getting nine months out of them? Other factors that I felt like contributed to their tenure was the size of the unit, how active they were, and the makeup of the unit committee.

My personal experience with Venturing Crew 8 during the past few years gave me a good insight into how important the unit committee is. While serving as my district's Order of the Arrow Chapter Adviser, our District Executive requested we form a Venturing Crew to give our OA ceremonies team an umbrella of insurance during Scouting events. Within a year, the youth wanted to expand the role of the Crew from just a legal entity to a fully active Scouting unit. They wanted to go on high adventure trips, leadership training, etc. Within two years of its start, the youth voted to expand the membership from just OA members to anyone qualifying for the Venturing program. We quickly recruited a number of new Scouts, forming a co-ed unit.

With this expansion, we had a number of parents showing up to meetings and wanting to register. To our advantage, most of these adults were already active in other troops and had already completed Wood Badge training. While we had established Associate Advisors, I took it upon myself to form the Crew Committee. The committee looked like a dream team of the best

our district had to offer; we even had one member who was a longtime Scoutmaster and had been awarded the Silver Beaver. One of the ways that makes Venturing different than the other Scouting programs is that the committee conducts the Board of Review for the Silver Award, which was the Eagle Scout equivalent for Venturing until 2014, when the program updated all its awards and changed the highest award to the Summit Award. I mention that because we were privileged to award the Silver Award to two of our Scouts. And to top it off, the Crew earned the Gold Level of the Journey to Excellence Award during the past two years.

With the experience of working with a well-trained and active committee, I knew how important they are with all programs in Scouting. The Pack and Troop Committees could serve their units with properly trained members. My questionnaire was designed to assess the makeup of these units (Appendix A).

CHAPTER 3

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

For research purposes, I've replaced the actual troop numbers with a generic 1-10 system. Troop 1 has fewer than 30 active youth (Appendix B). They've been chartered for more than 60 years. They've also attended a long-term summer camp program constantly for the past several years, as well as sent two adults and one youth to the previous National Jamboree. In the past three years, they've earned one of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award twice.

They've had the same Scoutmaster for eight years and he is Wood Badge trained. His predecessor served for more than six years and left after he needed a break. They currently have seven Assistant Scoutmasters, six of which have completed or are currently working on their Wood Badge training. They do have an assistant ready to take over as Scoutmaster and are implementing a plan to create a rotation for Scoutmaster. Their intention is to develop a plan to prevent Scoutmasters from getting burned out before a trained successor is in place.

This is an example of a troop whose unit leader is probably close to getting burned out after eight years. However, steps have been taken to ensure the next unit leader is properly trained and prepared to take over. This troop also has a feeder pack, registered with the same charter. The relationship between the troop and the pack are very close and positive. Until 2014, the pack had some issues with maintaining a Cubmaster, without replacing them every year. That unit's commissioner made an active effort to ensure the pack had a trained Cubmaster who has agreed to serve until another trained successor is chosen and ready.

While Troop 1 is considered a medium-sized troop in our council, proportionally, they appear to have more trained adults than a troop twice their size. As a commissioner, this is an example that I would refer other units to. Despite their relatively small size, they've taken the initiative to implement a program for their unit leader to already have received the necessary training and to ensure future ones don't get burned out. Having a year-limit on how long Scoutmasters can serve makes some units nervous, especially small ones. However, reaching out to smaller units and teaching them how to properly maintain a successful unit will hopefully keep these units active for decades to come.

Let's look at a different unit to compare. Troop 2 has 45 active youth and a Scoutmaster who's served for seven years (Appendix C). The previous Scoutmaster served for five years and left because his son earned his Eagle Scout and wanted to start a Venturing Crew. They currently have six active Assistant Scoutmasters, plus active committee members. Like Troop 1, they also have a succession plan in place; their next Scoutmaster is already Wood Badge trained.

This is a troop who also attends Philmont Scout Ranch and Florida Sea Base as a unit, not with their council's contingent. They also do other high adventure trips as a troop. They are one of several who are known for their high adventure trips. While this troop has only been chartered for a little over 10 years, they have put in place a system to ensure the next Scoutmaster is properly trained before taking over. This troop, however, does have a different dynamic than Troop 1. For instance, while they don't have a feeder pack, they do go around to other packs and give an impressive presentation for their Webelos. They cater to the Cub Scouts who might be more interested in backpacking and high adventure than the ones who aren't. This troop makes a

valiant effort to recruit new Scouts through multiple packs. While not having a feeder pack does make recruiting more difficult, it allows this troop to cater to more high adventure-oriented Scouts and the local Webelos who want to see a more high adventure troop.

While I recommend all troops have a feeder pack, if possible, this troop operates quite well without one. And the other troops whose feeder packs they're recruiting from haven't complained because Troop 2 is only signing up a handful of scouts per pack, instead of the entire Webelos den. And the Webelos they are recruiting are scouts who may have gotten bored with just a "normal" troop. Speaking with the youth of Troop 2 (both young and old), I've discovered that even the Tenderfoot scouts love the high adventure trips they take; the troop does allow the older scouts to do longer, more strenuous treks while not overwhelming the newer scouts. This is also a troop that I know uses the youth-led model. The SPL and Assistant SPL are both elected by the boys in the troop, as well as the Patrol Leaders. The Patrol Leader Council also takes an active step in planning every campout and meeting. I would accredit this to their Wood Badge trained leaders on every level.

Overall, this model of troop, while a little unorthodox, is one that I would consider to be a successful model that other troops should look at emulating. The parts I would definitely recommend others emulating are their troop committee structure, assistant leader training and youth-led structure.

Unfortunately, in my district, not every unit succeeds and sometimes they fold. Troop 3 was the lone troop that recently folded in a rural town (Appendix D). Troop 3 started up a couple of years ago with a new feeder pack in the same town. Some of the adult leaders were splitting

their time between both the troop and the pack. Having spent my teenage years in a small rural town, similar to this one, I understand that they are a close-knit community, so volunteering with both units wouldn't be anything unusual. In the summer before they folded, the troop had six scouts and five adult leaders. When they finally folded by recharter time (January), they had only two youth still interested. The Scoutmaster said that interest had deteriorated among the youth.

None of the assistant leaders had any type of Scouting background or training; only the Scoutmaster had completed fundamentals. They also didn't do any campouts outside the basic package and summer camp. I don't think they were even around long enough to get their new youth trained in their roles. This is a great example of a new troop, in a town with no other competing Scouting units, that wasn't able to recruit and train enough leaders to keep the troop active. Recruiting efforts were minimal and unsuccessful during fall recruitment. And despite a feeder pack, the pack was small and didn't have scouts in every program. The District Executive and myself both think that focusing the remaining efforts on the existing pack will result in gained interest in a troop in the next couple of years. We hope that by then, at least one or two of the adult leaders will be working on their Wood Badge training, which will help them maintain a new troop with the experienced Scouts from the feeder pack.

Examining their feeder pack, Pack 1, I discovered that the scouts didn't want to do a lot of traveling (Appendix E). Their survey told me they wanted to "stay local" and that "going places does not interest them." This is probably why they don't attend our council or district Cub scout camps; we call them Twilight Camps. Our council and district works hard on developing well-planned and well-run camps for our packs. We develop consistent themes and programs for

every district, so that while the local district leaders are running the camps, the scouts are getting the same instruction with the same materials. For example, our local Lowes hardware stores donate materials for projects like bird houses. It's those same donated materials that gets distributed throughout our council effectively. And of course, like the failed troop in that community, none of the leaders have been through fundamentals or any kind of training. Having this knowledge will allow me to focus on this unit and actively recruit their leaders to attend the appropriate training. I already did this approach last year with our next troop.

Troop 4 is a troop with over 25 active youth, serving an urban community with numerous competitive Scouting units (Appendix F). This is a troop whose current Scoutmaster started about five years ago after his predecessor left due to health reasons. The previous Scoutmaster had only completed fundamentals after taking the position, five years earlier. The current Scoutmaster has also only completed fundamentals, too, but earned Eagle Scout in his youth. While Troop 4 has over two dozen active scouts, they only average about two Eagle Scouts every three years. And while several of their youth attended past National Jamborees, none have been to any of the high adventure bases, such as Philmont, Sea Base or Northern Tier. Their camping program consists of basic camping trips, not too many out-of-state. However, they do attend summer camps out-of-state every year. Their youth are interested more in earning a lot of merit badges and experiencing different summer camps than doing many high adventure trips.

While their adult leadership has remained consistent over the years, it was only last year (after four years of working with them) that I was able to persuade one leader to attend Wood Badge. Most have sons that have already made Eagle Scout, but they continue to work with the

troop due to their own interest in Scouting. This new leader I persuaded into taking training was determined enough that he attended fundamentals in another district. That was primarily because our district not able to produce a fundamentals program due to lack of interest last year. I am happy that the newer leaders in this troop have shown interest in getting proper training and will continue to persuade more of their leaders to start Wood Badge. Because of my minor success there, I will use this approach not only again with Troop 4, but also with Pack 1.

Pack 2 is in a similar situation as Pack 1 (Appendix G). They are a new Pack in a rural community. And despite them having more dens, more scouts and more leaders, they still don't have the trained leaders necessary to keep this pack going. This community does not have a troop to feed into; however, there are several troops in multiple surrounding communities, all about the same driving distance. One possibility, though, would be to start up a new troop with the Webelos and their leaders. Because of the proximity of other troops fairly close to them, I'm a little against starting a new troop from scratch. My approach with Pack 2 will consist of encouraging the leaders to get trained for their positions and help them find which of the surrounding troops will fit their Webelos best.

Pack 3 (Appendix H) and Troop 5 (Appendix I) I want to discuss together. They are the lone troop and feeder pack in another rural community with no other competing Scouting units around. The reason I'm referring to both these together is because both programs are great examples of a rural community taking great aims to ensure a quality Cub Scout and Boy Scout program. Pack 3 is made up of about 80 scouts in all den levels. Their Cubmaster has served for over a decade and has consistently had over 30 assistants/den leaders; however, only six have

completed either BALOO or Fundamentals. Pack 3 participates in numerous council or district Twilight Camps, as well as earning the Journey to Excellence awards for several years in a row. This is an award that many units “earn,” yet they fail to complete the paperwork for the unit to receive the award. Pack 3 also serves as a feeder pack for Troop 5 and with 80-120 Cub Scouts registered at any given time, that provides for a steady stream of new scouts for Troop 5.

Troop 5 is also a prime example of a rural troop doing many things right. This troop has consistently had over 30 youth in their program. Despite the number of active youth, there’s only been two Eagle Scouts in the past four years. However, there are currently several Life rank scouts who are actively working on their Eagle projects at the time this paper was written. And despite the low number of Eagle Scouts, one of them has continued to serve as an Assistant Scoutmaster for the past two years. Troop 5 has over 20 assistant leaders; five of which have completed Fundamentals and three have completed Wood Badge. While the current Scoutmaster is in his upper 70s, he has verbally committed to *another* five to ten years. Despite this ambitious commitment, steps have been taken to assure a named successor is properly trained and ready to take over, in the event the current Scoutmaster has to step down.

This troop has been chartered for over 80 years and proudly displays their decades long history in their meeting room. The only real competitor for the troop are the middle school and high school sports teams. Most of the scouts play at least one sport on top of their scouting involvement. One of the ways the troop has accommodated their scouts is to start their meetings after practice. They also are forgiving on those who show up in their sports uniform instead of their scout uniform. Many leaders may feel the scout uniform is necessary during a meeting, but

this Scoutmaster made the decision that it's better to have them out of uniform and keep them than to lose them altogether with a strict uniform policy at weekly meetings.

Continuing to move across my district and across county lines, Troop 6 is another rural troop that's fairly new with an equally new feeder pack (Appendix J). The difference between this new rural troop is that the Scoutmaster and his lone assistant have both completed Wood Badge training. This troop has only four youth, but more are on the way with the upcoming Webelos in the new pack that's also in town. While the leaders have made a great effort to get trained and be committed to making a successful troop, I am keeping a close eye on them. I don't want Troop 6 to fade away like Troop 3. Despite being fairly new, the leaders had several years experience in another troop in a neighboring district. That little detail may be the key as to why one troop in one rural community succeeds while one in a neighboring rural community fades away.

The final Cub Scout pack I want to discuss is Pack 4 (Appendix K). Regarding the number of registered youth, they are a little larger than average; there's approximately 60 registered youth, with most of their parents also registering in some capacity. The Pack Committee is very active and supportive, holding regular committee meetings during den meetings. They are very aware of the finances of the pack and are constantly finding ways of not only raising money, but spending money, as well. Despite an active committee, there's only one Assistant Cubmaster and the Tiger Den has a bit of trouble recruiting the parents to serve as the den leader from year to year. Most of the den leaders do progress with their dens as they go from Wolf to Bear to Webelos, though. But, that first year Tiger Den has regularly been an issue with

parent recruitment. However, I don't think that's anything out of the ordinary for packs. Packs, especially Tiger Dens, are always the hardest at finding qualified volunteers who will serve more than one year. After serving for 18 months as the Cubmaster, that person just crossed over with the troop to assist with his son. That's also what happened to the previous Cubmaster. The brand new Cubmaster who started at the crossover ceremony, has no formal training or basic knowledge of Scout skills.

My experience has taught me that Cubmasters have the most frequent turnover rate combined with little or no training for their positions. My council has made an effort to change this with the Cub Mentor program. While the program has been successful for the packs taking advantage of it, not all the units have adapted it. The main reason for this is just lack of resources. Cub Mentors are volunteers, some who may have no other Scouting commitments, while others serve in numerous other positions. One of the areas I plan to focus on as District Commissioner is to not only continue the Cub Mentor program, but help to expand it with the aid of other devoted Commissioners.

The final troop I want to discuss is Troop 7 (Appendix L). This troop has probably the best dynamics of any Scouting unit. They have been registered for a number of years and have developed a strong troop system starting with their relationship to the chartered organization, continuing with the committee, and ending at the highly trained youth of the troop. The first aspect that keeps Troop 7 strong is that they have not one, but two feeder packs. This allows a steady stream of between 12 and 15 new scouts every year. There's sometimes even enough scouts that they will form two new patrols with them. Each new patrol gets a trained Troop

Guide, as well as at least two Assistant Scoutmasters. The Assistant Scoutmasters' training varies from leader to leader. Some are new parents with minimal Scouting skills, while others already completed Wood Badge; either with their pack or the troop. The total number of youth is usually close to 60 or 70 at any given time.

Another aspect of the troop that keeps them strong is their planned leader succession. Their plan involves a three-year commitment from an already Wood Badge trained parent. And if that parent's still working on their Wood Badge beads, that's usually good enough, too. The leader agrees to serve for three years as Scoutmaster and three years as Committee Chair. They have set dates for both transitions and don't usually have any issues with that. Another great aspect of the troop is that the youth takes a very active role in planning the 12-month long calendar. I think most Commissioners will tell you that's exactly how it's supposed to work, but I'm sure there's experienced Commissioners who have seen the exact opposite at least once.

One of the other observations I made with Troop 7 is that they plan trips to high adventure bases such as Florida Sea Base and Northern Tier Canoe Base. Our council usually sends contingents to most of the high adventure bases, but Troop 7 has enough financial and committee support to go on their own. And while they're not the only troop in our council that sends their own crews to these high adventure bases, they do it more often than most. This is partially due to the successful fundraising they undertake throughout the year.

The final thing that sets Troop 7 apart is the amount of service work they do throughout the year. Two reasons allow for them to devote more-than-average hours for a troop. One is having the amount of registered youth available to work these service hours. A troop with only

15 youth obviously doesn't have the manpower to devote the same amount of hours as a troop with 70 youth. The other reason is that the Scoutmaster and Troop Committee actively encourages these service projects; many of which are not necessarily Eagle Scout projects.

CHAPTER 4

CONCLUSION

One question I find Scouters asking is, “what makes a successful unit?” If you ask a District Executive, or any professional Scouter, they might say, “the troop with the most boys,” or “the troop with the most money and equipment.” If you ask an OA adviser, they might say, “the troop with the most OA members.” If you ask a parent, they might say, “the troop that camps the most.” If you ask a District Chair, they might say, “the troop with the most Eagle Scouts.” But if you ask a Commissioner, I would like to think the answer would be, “the troop where the youth learn the most and have the most fun.”

Scouting’s not always about how many merit badges you earn or how many times you go camping. The success of a unit should be determined by the *quality* of the program, not the *quantity* of the program. Part of the Commissioner’s job is to ensure our units have all the necessary tools and resources to provide that quality program. My district is made up of packs, troops, crews, teams and posts of so many various backgrounds. Some are brand new, while some were started during the Great Depression. Some have leaders who have been serving for over a decade while others are parents who have never been camping past their backyard.

One of the most effective ways Commissioners can ensure a unit is successful is to make sure their leaders know what they’re doing. Sometimes that means educating them about the proper training programs and sometimes it means assisting with recruiting at the local school. Sometimes it means being that extra driver they need for gear and sometimes it means helping them out with Boards of Review for their Tenderfoots. While dedicated volunteers debate what

exactly makes a unit successful, I don't think there's any debate that units with well-trained leaders last longer and provide a better program than those that don't. In this paper, I've explained how being a rural unit or urban unit is irrelevant. I've also explained how having a feeder pack isn't always necessary. And I've also explained how the number of scouts attending meetings or earning Eagle Scout doesn't influence the quality of program. Well-trained leaders are one of those things that units of any type, any age, any setting and in any time period should be maintained and encouraged.

APPENDIX A

QUESTIONNAIRE – BLANK FORM

This questionnaire is designed to study how Boy Scout units handle their unit leader stepping down from their position. Sometimes the unit committee is prepared with a trained successor in place and sometimes they are not. The results of this survey will be used in my Commissioner Doctoral thesis paper regarding unit leader succession. The results will be presented omitting specific names and unit numbers, so please be honest about situations on how unit leaders left.; all that will be mentioned is that they are districts and units in the Great Smoky Mountain Council.

Please return by October 31. Thank you for your participation, it is greatly appreciated.

1. What type of unit do you represent? (Pack, Troop, Crew, or Team)
2. How many youth are registered/active? (approximate)
3. How long have you served as the unit leader? (approximate)
4. What were the reasons you were chosen to serve as the unit leader?
5. What were the reasons for your previous unit leader's leaving?
6. How long did that unit leader serve? (if less than six months, please provide information on their predecessor)
7. Approximately how many assistant leaders do you have? (over the age of 21)
8. How many of those have completed Scoutmaster Fundamentals?
9. How many of those have completed (or currently taking) Wood Badge?
10. In the past 18 months, how many long-term camps did your unit attend? (Summer Camp, Twilight Camp, Winter Camp, etc.)

11. In the past 18 months, did your unit attend a national high adventure camp (Philmont, Sea Base, etc.), excluding individual scouts in a contingent troop?
12. In the past 3 years, did your unit earn any of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award?
(please provide the years)
13. If you represent a Boy Scout Troop, does your Troop have a feeder Pack?
14. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 10 years?
15. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 30 years? (skip, if no on previous)
16. If you were to step down as the unit leader tomorrow, is there an assistant leader who is prepared to serve as the new unit leader?
17. If yes, what Scouting background do they have? (Training, Eagle Scout, etc)
18. Please list any additional information you feel is relevant that was not asked:

Thank you for participating in this survey. Your information is very valuable to examining how prepared or not prepared units in our council are to dealing with unit leader succession. Upon completion, this paper will be available online through <http://pacommissionercollege.com/>

APPENDIX B

QUESTIONNAIRE – TROOP 1

1. What type of unit do you represent? (Pack, Troop, Crew, or Team)

Troop 1

2. How many youth are registered/active? (approximate)

Troop 1 - 30-plus

3. How long have you served as the unit leader? (approximate)

Troop 1 - 8 years

4. What were the reasons you were chosen to serve as the unit leader?

Troop 1 - Youth in the program.

5. What were the reasons for your previous unit leader's leaving?

Troop 1 - Needed a break.

6. How long did that unit leader serve? (if less than six months, please provide information on their predecessor)

Troop 1 - More than 6 years

7. Approximately how many assistant leaders do you have? (over the age of 21)

Troop 1 - 7

8. How many of those have completed Scoutmaster Fundamentals?

Troop 1 - 5

9. How many of those have completed (or currently taking) Wood Badge?

Troop 1 - 6

10. In the past 18 months, how many long-term camps did your unit attend? (Summer Camp, Twilight Camp, Winter Camp, etc.)

Troop 1 - 2 Council Summer Camps

11. In the past 18 months, did your unit attend a national high adventure camp (Philmont, Sea Base, etc.), excluding individual scouts in a contingent troop?

Troop 1 - 3, one youth and two adults went to Jambo

12. In the past 3 years, did your unit earn any of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award?
(please provide the years)

Troop 1 - 2, need to sit down with Unit Commish and work on the current year

13. If you represent a Boy Scout Troop, does your Troop have a feeder Pack?

Troop 1 - Yes

14. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 10 years?

Troop 1 - Yes

15. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 30 years? (skip, if no on previous)

Troop 1 - Yes, 60+

16. If you were to step down as the unit leader tomorrow, is there an assistant leader who is prepared to serve as the new unit leader?

Troop 1 - Yes

17. If yes, what Scouting background do they have? (Training, Eagle Scout, etc)

Troop 1 - Some training, experience and desire to continue their BSA training

APPENDIX C

QUESTIONNAIRE – TROOP 2

1. What type of unit do you represent? (Pack, Troop, Crew, or Team)

Troop 2

2. How many youth are registered/active? (approximate)

Troop 2 - 45

3. How long have you served as the unit leader? (approximate)

Troop 2 - 7 years

4. What were the reasons you were chosen to serve as the unit leader?

Troop 2 - Actively involved in troop. Interested.

5. What were the reasons for your previous unit leader's leaving?

Troop 2 - Son had earned Eagle. He wanted to start a Venture Crew.

6. How long did that unit leader serve? (if less than six months, please provide information on their predecessor)

Troop 2 - More than 5 years

7. Approximately how many assistant leaders do you have? (over the age of 21)

Troop 2 - 6 (plus many active Committee members)

8. How many of those have completed Scoutmaster Fundamentals?

Troop 2 - 5 (plus some Committee members)

9. How many of those have completed (or currently taking) Wood Badge?

Troop 2 - 7 (including Committee members)

10. In the past 18 months, how many long-term camps did your unit attend? (Summer Camp, Twilight Camp, Winter Camp, etc.)

Troop 2 - 2

11. In the past 18 months, did your unit attend a national high adventure camp (Philmont, Sea Base, etc.), excluding individual scouts in a contingent troop?

Troop 2 - 2

12. In the past 3 years, did your unit earn any of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award?
(please provide the years)

Troop 2 - Didn't fill out evaluation. Certainly would have.

13. If you represent a Boy Scout Troop, does your Troop have a feeder Pack?

Troop 2 - No

14. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 10 years?

Troop 2 - Yes

15. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 30 years? (skip, if no on previous)

Troop 2 - No

16. If you were to step down as the unit leader tomorrow, is there an assistant leader who is prepared to serve as the new unit leader?

Troop 2 - Yes

17. If yes, what Scouting background do they have? (Training, Eagle Scout, etc)

Troop 2 - Fully trained (including Wood Badge)

APPENDIX D

QUESTIONNAIRE – TROOP 3

1. What type of unit do you represent? (Pack, Troop, Crew, or Team)

Troop 3

2. How many youth are registered/active? (approximate)

Troop 3 - 6

3. How long have you served as the unit leader? (approximate)

Troop 3 - 2 and a half years

4. What were the reasons you were chosen to serve as the unit leader?

Troop 3 - Wanted to help out the local troop

5. What were the reasons for your previous unit leader's leaving?

Troop 3 - No previous leader, new troop

6. How long did that unit leader serve? (if less than six months, please provide information on their predecessor)

Troop 3 - N/A

7. Approximately how many assistant leaders do you have? (over the age of 21)

Troop 3 - 5

8. How many of those have completed Scoutmaster Fundamentals?

Troop 3 - None

9. How many of those have completed (or currently taking) Wood Badge?

Troop 3 - None

10. In the past 18 months, how many long-term camps did your unit attend? (Summer Camp, Twilight Camp, Winter Camp, etc.)

Troop 3 - 1

11. In the past 18 months, did your unit attend a national high adventure camp (Philmont, Sea Base, etc.), excluding individual scouts in a contingent troop?

Troop 3 - No

12. In the past 3 years, did your unit earn any of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award?
(please provide the years)

Troop 3 - No

13. If you represent a Boy Scout Troop, does your Troop have a feeder Pack?

Troop 3 - Yes

14. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 10 years?

Troop 3 - Yes

15. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 30 years? (skip, if no on previous)

Troop 3 - No

16. If you were to step down as the unit leader tomorrow, is there an assistant leader who is prepared to serve as the new unit leader?

Troop 3 - No

17. If yes, what Scouting background do they have? (Training, Eagle Scout, etc)

Troop 3 - N/A

APPENDIX E

QUESTIONNAIRE – PACK 1

1. What type of unit do you represent? (Pack, Troop, Crew, or Team)

Pack 1

2. How many youth are registered/active? (approximate)

Pack 1 - 5

3. How long have you served as the unit leader? (approximate)

Pack 1 - 4 years

4. What were the reasons you were chosen to serve as the unit leader?

Pack 1 - No one else stepped up, wanted to my son to be a scout, so I do what I have to in order to make that happen.

5. What were the reasons for your previous unit leader's leaving?

Pack 1 - N/A

6. How long did that unit leader serve? (if less than six months, please provide information on their predecessor)

Pack 1 - N/A

7. Approximately how many assistant leaders do you have? (over the age of 21)

Pack 1 - 1

8. How many of those have completed Scoutmaster Fundamentals?

Pack 1 - None

9. How many of those have completed (or currently taking) Wood Badge?

Pack 1 - None

10. In the past 18 months, how many long-term camps did your unit attend? (Summer Camp, Twilight Camp, Winter Camp, etc.)

Pack 1 - 0

11. In the past 18 months, did your unit attend a national high adventure camp (Philmont, Sea Base, etc.), excluding individual scouts in a contingent troop?

Pack 1 - No

12. In the past 3 years, did your unit earn any of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award?
(please provide the years)

Pack 1 - No

13. If you represent a Boy Scout Troop, does your Troop have a feeder Pack?

Pack 1 - N/A

14. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 10 years?

Pack 1 - No

15. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 30 years? (skip, if no on previous)

Pack 1 - No

16. If you were to step down as the unit leader tomorrow, is there an assistant leader who is prepared to serve as the new unit leader?

Pack 1 - No

17. If yes, what Scouting background do they have? (Training, Eagle Scout, etc)

Pack 1 - N/A

18. Please list any additional information you feel is relevant that was not asked:

Pack 1 - The boys want to stay local. Going places does not interest them. Started off with a huge pack sign up but no one wanted to be a leader. Only 4-5 are still meeting out of 25.

APPENDIX F

QUESTIONNAIRE – TROOP 4

1. What type of unit do you represent? (Pack, Troop, Crew, or Team)

Troop 4

2. How many youth are registered/active? (approximate)

Troop 4 - 28

3. How long have you served as the unit leader? (approximate)

Troop 4 - 5 years

4. What were the reasons you were chosen to serve as the unit leader?

Troop 4 - Previous Scoutmaster stepped down.

5. What were the reasons for your previous unit leader's leaving?

Troop 4 - Health reasons.

6. How long did that unit leader serve? (if less than six months, please provide information on their predecessor)

Troop 4 - About 6 years

7. Approximately how many assistant leaders do you have? (over the age of 21)

Troop 4 - 12

8. How many of those have completed Scoutmaster Fundamentals?

Troop 4 - 4

9. How many of those have completed (or currently taking) Wood Badge?

Troop 4 - 1

10. In the past 18 months, how many long-term camps did your unit attend? (Summer Camp, Twilight Camp, Winter Camp, etc.)

Troop 4 - 2

11. In the past 18 months, did your unit attend a national high adventure camp (Philmont, Sea Base, etc.), excluding individual scouts in a contingent troop?

Troop 4 - Yes, National Jambo

12. In the past 3 years, did your unit earn any of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award?
(please provide the years)

Troop 4 - Didn't apply.

13. If you represent a Boy Scout Troop, does your Troop have a feeder Pack?

Troop 4 - No

14. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 10 years?

Troop 4 - Yes

15. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 30 years? (skip, if no on previous)

Troop 4 - Yes

16. If you were to step down as the unit leader tomorrow, is there an assistant leader who is prepared to serve as the new unit leader?

Troop 4 - Yes

17. If yes, what Scouting background do they have? (Training, Eagle Scout, etc)

Troop 4 - Wood Badge

APPENDIX G

QUESTIONNAIRE – PACK 2

1. What type of unit do you represent? (Pack, Troop, Crew, or Team)

Pack 2

2. How many youth are registered/active? (approximate)

Pack 2 - 7

3. How long have you served as the unit leader? (approximate)

Pack 2 - Two months

4. What were the reasons you were chosen to serve as the unit leader?

Pack 2 - I was the only volunteer for this position.

5. What were the reasons for your previous unit leader's leaving?

Pack 2 - N/A

6. How long did that unit leader serve? (if less than six months, please provide information on their predecessor)

Pack 2 - N/A

7. Approximately how many assistant leaders do you have? (over the age of 21)

Pack 2 - 3 den leaders and 3 assistants

8. How many of those have completed Scoutmaster Fundamentals?

Pack 2 - None

9. How many of those have completed (or currently taking) Wood Badge?

Pack 2 - None

10. In the past 18 months, how many long-term camps did your unit attend? (Summer Camp, Twilight Camp, Winter Camp, etc.)

Pack 2 - 0

11. In the past 18 months, did your unit attend a national high adventure camp (Philmont, Sea Base, etc.), excluding individual scouts in a contingent troop?

Pack 2 - N/A

12. In the past 3 years, did your unit earn any of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award?
(please provide the years)

Pack 2 - N/A

13. If you represent a Boy Scout Troop, does your Troop have a feeder Pack?

Pack 2 - N/A

14. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 10 years?

Pack 2 - No

15. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 30 years? (skip, if no on previous)

Pack 2 - No

16. If you were to step down as the unit leader tomorrow, is there an assistant leader who is prepared to serve as the new unit leader?

Pack 2 - No

17. If yes, what Scouting background do they have? (Training, Eagle Scout, etc)

Pack 2 - N/A

APPENDIX H
QUESTIONNAIRE – PACK 3

1. What type of unit do you represent? (Pack, Troop, Crew, or Team)

Pack 3

2. How many youth are registered/active? (approximate)

Pack 3 - 80

3. How long have you served as the unit leader? (approximate)

Pack 3 - 10 years+

4. What were the reasons you were chosen to serve as the unit leader?

Pack 3 - Wanted to serve local pack, grandkids in pack.

5. What were the reasons for your previous unit leader's leaving?

Pack 3 - Wanted a break.

6. How long did that unit leader serve? (if less than six months, please provide information on their predecessor)

Pack 3 - 3 years

7. Approximately how many assistant leaders do you have? (over the age of 21)

Pack 3 - 35+

8. How many of those have completed Scoutmaster Fundamentals?

Pack 3 - 6

9. How many of those have completed (or currently taking) Wood Badge?

Pack 3 - 3

10. In the past 18 months, how many long-term camps did your unit attend? (Summer Camp, Twilight Camp, Winter Camp, etc.)

Pack 3 - 3

11. In the past 18 months, did your unit attend a national high adventure camp (Philmont, Sea Base, etc.), excluding individual scouts in a contingent troop?

Pack 3 - N/A

12. In the past 3 years, did your unit earn any of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award?
(please provide the years)

Pack 3 - Yes, all.

13. If you represent a Boy Scout Troop, does your Troop have a feeder Pack?

Pack 3 - N/A

14. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 10 years?

Pack 3 - Yes

15. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 30 years? (skip, if no on previous)

Pack 3 - Yes

16. If you were to step down as the unit leader tomorrow, is there an assistant leader who is prepared to serve as the new unit leader?

Pack 3 - Yes

17. If yes, what Scouting background do they have? (Training, Eagle Scout, etc)

Pack 3 - Training

APPENDIX I

QUESTIONNAIRE – TROOP 5

1. What type of unit do you represent? (Pack, Troop, Crew, or Team)

Troop 5

2. How many youth are registered/active? (approximate)

Troop 5 - 30

3. How long have you served as the unit leader? (approximate)

Troop 5 - 10 years

4. What were the reasons you were chosen to serve as the unit leader?

Troop 5 - Wanted to.

5. What were the reasons for your previous unit leader's leaving?

Troop 5 - N/A

6. How long did that unit leader serve? (if less than six months, please provide information on their predecessor)

Troop 5 - N/A

7. Approximately how many assistant leaders do you have? (over the age of 21)

Troop 5 - 20

8. How many of those have completed Scoutmaster Fundamentals?

Troop 5 - 5

9. How many of those have completed (or currently taking) Wood Badge?

Troop 5 - 3

10. In the past 18 months, how many long-term camps did your unit attend? (Summer Camp, Twilight Camp, Winter Camp, etc.)

Troop 5 - 2 Summer, 2 Winter, 1 long term canoe trip

11. In the past 18 months, did your unit attend a national high adventure camp (Philmont, Sea Base, etc.), excluding individual scouts in a contingent troop?

Troop 5 - Yes

12. In the past 3 years, did your unit earn any of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award?
(please provide the years)

Troop 5 - Yes

13. If you represent a Boy Scout Troop, does your Troop have a feeder Pack?

Troop 5 - Yes

14. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 10 years?

Troop 5 - Yes

15. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 30 years? (skip, if no on previous)

Troop 5 - Yes

16. If you were to step down as the unit leader tomorrow, is there an assistant leader who is prepared to serve as the new unit leader?

Troop 5 - Yes

17. If yes, what Scouting background do they have? (Training, Eagle Scout, etc)

Troop 5 - Training, Eagle Scout background

APPENDIX J

QUESTIONNAIRE – TROOP 6

1. What type of unit do you represent? (Pack, Troop, Crew, or Team)

Troop 6

2. How many youth are registered/active? (approximate)

Troop 6 - 4

3. How long have you served as the unit leader? (approximate)

Troop 6 - The beginning/new troop (1 year)

4. What were the reasons you were chosen to serve as the unit leader?

Troop 6 - Started the troop.

5. What were the reasons for your previous unit leader's leaving?

Troop 6 - N/A

6. How long did that unit leader serve? (if less than six months, please provide information on their predecessor)

Troop 6 - N/A

7. Approximately how many assistant leaders do you have? (over the age of 21)

Troop 6 - 1

8. How many of those have completed Scoutmaster Fundamentals?

Troop 6 - All

9. How many of those have completed (or currently taking) Wood Badge?

Troop 6 - All

10. In the past 18 months, how many long-term camps did your unit attend? (Summer Camp, Twilight Camp, Winter Camp, etc.)

Troop 6 - 3

11. In the past 18 months, did your unit attend a national high adventure camp (Philmont, Sea Base, etc.), excluding individual scouts in a contingent troop?

Troop 6 - No

12. In the past 3 years, did your unit earn any of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award?
(please provide the years)

Troop 6 - No

13. If you represent a Boy Scout Troop, does your Troop have a feeder Pack?

Troop 6 - Yes

14. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 10 years?

Troop 6 - No

15. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 30 years? (skip, if no on previous)

Troop 6 - No

16. If you were to step down as the unit leader tomorrow, is there an assistant leader who is prepared to serve as the new unit leader?

Troop 6 - Yes

17. If yes, what Scouting background do they have? (Training, Eagle Scout, etc)

Troop 6 - Wood Badge Training

APPENDIX K

QUESTIONNAIRE – PACK 4

1. What type of unit do you represent? (Pack, Troop, Crew, or Team)

Pack 4

2. How many youth are registered/active? (approximate)

Pack 4 - 60

3. How long have you served as the unit leader? (approximate)

Pack 4 - 18 months

4. What were the reasons you were chosen to serve as the unit leader?

Pack 4 - Nobody else would do it.

5. What were the reasons for your previous unit leader's leaving?

Pack 4 - Son crossed over to troop.

6. How long did that unit leader serve? (if less than six months, please provide information on their predecessor)

Pack 4 - 2 years

7. Approximately how many assistant leaders do you have? (over the age of 21)

Pack 4 - 1

8. How many of those have completed Scoutmaster Fundamentals?

Pack 4 - None

9. How many of those have completed (or currently taking) Wood Badge?

Pack 4 - None

10. In the past 18 months, how many long-term camps did your unit attend? (Summer Camp, Twilight Camp, Winter Camp, etc.)

Pack 4 - 2 Twilight Camps, 1 Winter Camp

11. In the past 18 months, did your unit attend a national high adventure camp (Philmont, Sea Base, etc.), excluding individual scouts in a contingent troop?

Pack 4 - N/A

12. In the past 3 years, did your unit earn any of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award?
(please provide the years)

Pack 4 - Didn't apply

13. If you represent a Boy Scout Troop, does your Troop have a feeder Pack?

Pack 4 - N/A

14. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 10 years?

Pack 4 - Yes

15. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 30 years? (skip, if no on previous)

Pack 4 - Don't know

16. If you were to step down as the unit leader tomorrow, is there an assistant leader who is prepared to serve as the new unit leader?

Pack 4 - Yes

17. If yes, what Scouting background do they have? (Training, Eagle Scout, etc)

Pack 4 - Some knowledge of cub scout program

APPENDIX L

QUESTIONNAIRE – TROOP 7

1. What type of unit do you represent? (Pack, Troop, Crew, or Team)

Troop 7

2. How many youth are registered/active? (approximate)

Troop 7 - 60-plus

3. How long have you served as the unit leader? (approximate)

Troop 7 - 2 years

4. What were the reasons you were chosen to serve as the unit leader?

Troop 7 - Planned succession (3 year commitment)

5. What were the reasons for your previous unit leader's leaving?

Troop 7 - Planned succession

6. How long did that unit leader serve? (if less than six months, please provide information on their predecessor)

Troop 7 - 3 years

7. Approximately how many assistant leaders do you have? (over the age of 21)

Troop 7 - 26

8. How many of those have completed Scoutmaster Fundamentals?

Troop 7 - 12

9. How many of those have completed (or currently taking) Wood Badge?

Troop 7 - 8

10. In the past 18 months, how many long-term camps did your unit attend? (Summer Camp, Twilight Camp, Winter Camp, etc.)

Troop 7 - 2

11. In the past 18 months, did your unit attend a national high adventure camp (Philmont, Sea Base, etc.), excluding individual scouts in a contingent troop?

Troop 7 - Yes, Sea Base

12. In the past 3 years, did your unit earn any of the levels of the Journey to Excellence Award?
(please provide the years)

Troop 7 - Yes

13. If you represent a Boy Scout Troop, does your Troop have a feeder Pack?

Troop 7 - Yes

14. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 10 years?

Troop 7 - Yes

15. Has your unit been currently chartered for more than 30 years? (skip, if no on previous)

Troop 7 - Yes

16. If you were to step down as the unit leader tomorrow, is there an assistant leader who is prepared to serve as the new unit leader?

Troop 7 - Yes

17. If yes, what Scouting background do they have? (Training, Eagle Scout, etc)

Troop 7 - Wood Badge